

INSTRUCTIONS FOR DATA COLLECTION FOR RESEARCH PROJECT

“Beyond Words: Latin American Truth Commissions’ Recommendations”

Elin Skaar, Eric Wiebelhaus-Brahm, and Jemima García-Godos
24.11.2016

The Beyond Words project seeks to advance our knowledge of how truth commission recommendations are formulated and the circumstances under which they are more or less likely to be implemented. The project has three specific goals:

- I: Identify the **factors that have influenced the formulation, inclusion, and nature** of the recommendations made in the truth commission report.
- II. **Document the implementation**, or lack thereof, of each individual TCR.
- III: **Identify the factors that have facilitated or hampered the implementation** of the TCRs in each country case.

ENTERING AND CODING DATA FOR THE BEYOND WORDS PROJECT

We are interested in evaluating the implementation of each truth commission recommendation (TCR) separately. As such, the data must be entered on a TCR-by-TCR basis. We are organizing the data based upon *the Table of Contents (TOC) for each truth commission (TC) report*. Please follow the exact order that the TCRs appear in the TC report.

Each truth commission has a separate Excel file. Each file contains three sheets, comprising in total four main parts (A-D):

1. A) General information about the recommendations, and B) Categorizing TCRs by type
2. C) Formulation of TCRs
3. D) Events surrounding TCR implementation (or lack thereof)

Parts A and B deal with the characteristics of **individual TCRs** (sheet one).

Part C deals with the **circumstances in which the TRCs were created** (sheet two).

Part D deals with the **implementation of the TCRs** (sheet three).

Below, we provide more details on how to code the data for each of the four parts to enable future data analysis. Before proceeding, however, first some general points about using the TC files.

Identification numbers: Each truth commission has an identification number (ID). The Excel sheets are listed in alphabetical order according to country names with Argentina first and Uruguay last. Note that two countries have had two truth commissions: Chile and Uruguay. There are thus 11

countries, but 13 truth commission. Each TC has been given a number: Argentina TC = 1, Brazil TC = 2; Uruguay's more recent TC = 13.

The identification numbers given to each of the TCRs follow this logic. We have added the three first letters of the country prior to the number: ARG 1, BRA 2, CHI 3 (Rettig), CHI 4 (Valech), ECU 5, ELS 6, GUA 7, HAI 8, PAN 9, PAR 10, PER 11, URU 12 (Disappearances Commission), URU 13 (Peace Commission).

The IDs for the Argentinean TCRs are thus ARG 1.1, ARG 1.2, ARG 1.3, etc. Those for Brazil are BRA 2.1, BRA 2.2, BRA 2.3, etc. The recommendations of the last commission on the list, Peace Commission in Uruguay, has identification numbers URU 13.1, URU 13.2, URU 13.3, etc. The TCRs are numbered in the order in which they are presented in the TC report.

How to add more recommendations: It is very important that each TC recommendation have a separate ID number. In the Excel sheets in the database, we have listed 40 IDs per truth commission as a point of departure. However, the actual number of recommendations vary greatly among different TCs. If the number is less than 40, just leave the remaining data sheet empty. If the number is higher than 40, you **simply add more lines by inserting a new row** in the Excel sheet. Make sure that you start a new line for each new recommendation and give the recommendation the appropriate ID.

How to add more implementing events: An 'implementing event' is an action that is taken that relates to the implementation of a particular TCR. The implementing event may advance the implementation of a TCR, or it may delay, obstruct, or in other ways prevent the implementation of a TCR. Implementing events may involve government actors (such as the executive branch, the legislature, the courts, the military, etc.) and/or non-state actors such as opposition political parties, activists, victims' groups, or other civil society organizations. If there is more than one implementation event for the TCR in question, **add a new line by inserting a new row** in the Excel sheet. Each event that advances or obstructs the implementation process should be listed on a separate line and given a unique Implementation ID. For example, the passing of a new law recommended by a TC may involve one or more days of legislative debate, a final vote, approval or veto by the executive, and the date on which the law comes into force. Remember to keep the same ID for the implementing events as for the TCR to which they correspond. For example, if the TCR has ID 3.9 and there are three implementation events, the events should be labelled 3.9.1, 3.9.2, and 3.9.3. See below for more specific instructions on coding implementing events.

How to record sources in Excel: For all collected material, make sure that you note down the exact source of information.

We also strongly recommend that, in a document separate from the database, you maintain a detailed list of sources grouped according to type. For instance, digital sources, government documents, newspaper articles, journal articles, government reports, informants (personal interviews), etc. For information collected through interviews, note the interviewee's name, institutional affiliation, as well as the place and date of the interview.

CODING MANUAL

Again, in terms of organization, each truth commission has its own separate Excel file, with the Chilean and Uruguayan TCs ordered chronologically (i.e., CHI 3 = Rettig, CHI 4 = Valech, URU 12 = Commission Disappeared, URU 13 = Peace Commission).

Each Excel file has three sheets within it. The first sheet labelled 'TCRs [Country Name]' consists of two parts: (A) a list of all of the recommendations made in the TC's report; and (B) 'TCR Types'. The latter is to categorize each TCR along a range of characteristics that we hypothesize may influence whether or not the TCR is implemented.

The second sheet labelled "Formulation TCRs [Country Name]" will be used to record data related to the formulation and inclusion or exclusion of specific recommendations in the TC report.

The third and final sheet, "Implementation TCRs [Country Name]", will be used to record data on specific events related to the implementation (or non-implementation) of each TCR.

Sheet One: TC Recommendations (TCRs) [Country Name]

The goal of this sheet is to (A) record all the recommendations listed in the TC's report, and (B) to categorize TCRs into various types that we hypothesize may influence the likelihood of the TCR being implemented. In the Type area of the sheet, for each TCR, please check the boxes (by typing an 'X') that best describe the TCR. NOTE: Each TCR may fall within more than one type. Descriptions of each type can be found below.

OVERVIEW OF TC RECOMMENDATIONS

Column A: TC short name: Already provided. Repeat if you add new lines.

Column B: **Rec ID: Each recommendation in the data set will have its own unique identification number. The first recommendation for TC 1 (Argentina) will have a Rec ID = ARG 1.1, the third recommendation listed in Brazil's report will have a Rec ID = BRA 2.3, etc. Recommendations may be long and complex; multiple recommendations may be listed under what the commission has labelled one recommendation. If the recommendation actually contains several recommendations, record the entire text of the recommendation in the row. We will deal with the complexity of implementing different parts of a complex recommendation in sheet 3 (more details below).**

If you add more lines for additional recommendations, number them consecutively. Again, each recommendation should be listed in this sheet in the same order in which they are presented in the TC report.

Column C: Volume and chapter: Record where in the TC report the recommendation is listed.

Column D: Pages: Provide the exact page(s) where the TCR appears in the TC report.

Column E: Recommendation (original language): List the recommendation word-for-word as it appears in the original text of the TC report.

Column F: Recommendation (English): Provide an English translation of the recommendation.

Column G: Description of recommendation (language of report): If the main recommendation is explicitly divided into several parts, enter a new row for each item, but keep the original ID. The point of listing them separately line by line is so that we can distinguish between the implementation (or lack thereof) of different parts of the TCR. To enable us to track each row separately, please use small letters as in ARG 1.3a, 1.3b, 1.3c, etc.

Column H: Description of recommendation (English) Provide an English translation of the sub-category/sub-recommendation in Column G.

Column I: Notes: Here you may record any information that you find important, confusing, problematic, etc. related to the text of the TCR.

Column J: Number of implementing events: Enter the number of specific events related to the implementation of that specific recommendation. The number indicated here should be the same as the number of implementing events listed/discussed in sheet 3. For example, if in sheet 3 the last implementing event for TCR ARG 2.2 has an implementation ID of 2.2.6, you should enter 6 in this column.

Column K: Column is not used.

TYPES OF RECOMMENDATION

Column L: Institutional reform: Does the TCR address institutional reform (such as reform of the courts, the police, the military, etc.)?

Column M: Legal: Does the TCR relate to legal or administrative reform? Does it recommend that new laws be created, or existing ones be revised?

Column N: Constitutional: Does the TCR call for the constitution to be amended?

Column O: Criminal: Does the TCR call for the prosecution of individuals for past crimes?

Column P: Reparations: Enter the type(s) of reparations recommended in this TCR from this list: Individual, collective, symbolic, and/or material. Note that some reparations may fit multiple types.

Column Q: Non-repetition: Is the TCR intended to reduce in the future the types of human rights violations that occurred in the past?

Column R: Follow-up: Does the TCR urge the government to create a body to monitor/coordinate the implementation of TCRs and/or further address past human rights violations?

Column S: Other: Please provide comments (or suggest new categories) if you feel the TCR provides some means of addressing past human rights abuses that is not covered by the other categories.

Column T: Notes: Here you may record any information that you find important, confusing, problematic, etc. related to coding the TCR type.

Column U: Column is not used.

TCR DICHOTOMIES

This section is an attempt to categorize TCRs based upon their characteristics

Column V and W: General vs. Specific

General/specific: TCR is formulated in a general, broad, vague manner / TCR provides some level of detail on beneficiaries, content, implementing actor, etc.

Column X and Y: Targeted vs. Universal

Targeted/universal: TCR directed at specific beneficiaries, institutions or sectors / TCR directed to society as a whole.

Column Z and AA: Individual vs. Collective

Individual/collective: TCR designed to address individuals / TCR designed to address collectives, groups of people such as ethnic groups, political groups, etc.

Column AB and AC: Forward-Looking vs. Backward-Looking

Forward/backward looking: TCR aimed to prevent future human rights violations / TCR aimed at addressing human rights violations of the past.

Column AD and AE: Obligation of Means vs. Obligation of Results

Obligations of means/ obligations of results: TCR recommends the state should provide the means to achieve specific goals / TCR recommends that the state should reach or produce a specific result or output.

Column AF: Notes: Here you may record any information that you find important, confusing, problematic, etc. related to coding the TCR according to these dichotomies.

Sheet Two: Formulation TCRs [Country Name]

Note: The last row on the sheet contains the TC ID, not the Rec ID. Use this row to provide details about actors and factors that influenced the TC's recommendations as a whole rather than specific TCRs.

Column A: TC short name: See Sheet One above.

Column B: Rec ID: See Sheet One above.

Column C: Actors: Describe the actors that tried to influence the formulation of the TCR, explain how they sought to influence the TC and why, and explain whether they were successful.

Column D: Factors: Describe circumstances and/or structural factors (local, national, and international) that influenced the language of the TCR. Explain how the content of the TCR was influenced by each factor.

Column E: **SOURCE actors:** List exactly where you got the information from regarding the actors involved being as specific as possible (for example, a government bill, newspaper article, informant, etc.)

Column F: **SOURCE factors:** List exactly where you got the information from regarding the circumstances and/or structural factors (local, national, and international) being as specific as possible (for example, a government bill, newspaper article, informant, etc.)

Column G: Notes: Here you may record any information that you find important, confusing, problematic, etc. related to how the TCR was formulated that does not fit in any of the other columns.

Sheet Three: Implementation TCRs [Country Name]

Column A: TC short name: See Sheet One above.

Column B: Rec ID: See Sheet One above.

Column C: Implementation ID: If there is more than one implementation event for the TCR in question, add a new line by inserting a new row in the spreadsheet. Remember to keep the same ID for the implementing events as for the TCR to which they correspond. So: if the TCR has Rec ID = CHI 3.9 and there are three implementation events, these should be labelled 3.9.1, 3.9.2, and 3.9.3. The last digit is marked with an 'X' in the Excel file. **For the implementation events, drop the country letters and use numbers only.**

Column D: Implementation event (descriptive narrative): Provide a detailed description of the event that either advanced or failed to advance the implementation of the TCR.

Column E: Date of implementation event (day-month-year): Give the exact date, if possible, on which the event occurred. Each step in the implementation process should be listed on a separate line and given a unique Implementation ID. For example, the passing of a new law recommended by a TC may involve one or more days of legislative debate, a final vote, approval or veto by the executive, and the date on which the law comes into force. If unable to provide the specific date, provide as much detail as possible and explain in the Notes (Column R).

Column F: Implementing actor: Who or what was responsible for taking the step to implement the recommendation?

Column G: Supporting actor: Who or what was promoting the implementation of the recommendation?

Column H: Obstructing actor: Who or what was opposing the implementation of the recommendation?

Column I: Facilitating factors: Describe circumstances and/or structural factors (local, national, international) that supported the implementation of the TCR.

Column J: Hampering factors: Describe circumstances and/or structural factors (local, national, international) that obstructed or hampered the implementation of the TCR.

Column K: Funding: Who financed the activities described in this implementation event?

Column L: **SOURCE implementation event:** List exactly where you got the information from being as specific as possible (for example, a government bill, newspaper article, informant, etc.)

Column M: **SOURCE date of implementation event:** List exactly where you got the information from being as specific as possible (for example, a government bill, newspaper article, informant, etc.)

Column N: **SOURCE implementing actor:** List exactly where you got the information from being as specific as possible (for example, a government bill, newspaper article, informant, etc.)

Column O: **SOURCE supporting actor:** List exactly where you got the information from being as specific as possible (for example, a government bill, newspaper article, informant, etc.)

Column P: **SOURCE obstructing actor:** List exactly where you got the information from being as specific as possible (for example, a government bill, newspaper article, informant, etc.)

Column Q: **SOURCE facilitating factors:** List exactly where you got the information from being as specific as possible (for example, a government bill, newspaper article, informant, etc.)

Column R: **SOURCE hampering factors:** List exactly where you got the information from being as specific as possible (for example, a government bill, newspaper article, informant, etc.)

Column S: **SOURCE funding:** List exactly where you got the information from being as specific as possible (for example, a government bill, newspaper article, informant, etc.)

Note that the information in columns L-S could be the same, or different. Even if it is the same, please enter the full details in each cell. Remember that anybody accessing the database should be able to find the same information by using the source provided.

Column T: Notes: Here you may record any information that you find important, confusing, problematic, etc. related to actions related to implementing the TCR that does not fit in any of the other columns.